

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

IN RE: PHILIPS RECALLED CPAP, BI-
LEVEL PAP, AND MECHANICAL
VENTILATOR PRODUCTS
LITIGATION

Master Docket: Misc. No. 21-mc-1230-JFC

MDL No. 3014

This Document Relates to:

*All Actions Asserting Economic Loss
Claims*

**NOTICE OF FILING OF OBJECTIONS TO THE PROPOSED CLASS
ACTION SETTLEMENT AND RELEASE OF ECONOMIC LOSS CLAIMS**

Pursuant to the Order Preliminarily Approving the Proposed Class Settlement Agreement and Release of Economic Loss Claims (ECF No. 2289) (the “Preliminary Approval Order”), Settlement Class Counsel attach hereto as Exhibits “1” through “78” the Objections to the proposed Settlement received by the Settlement Administrator:

Exhibit No.	Objector	Request to Appear?
1	Adams, Daniel R.	No.
2	Angob, Cristito M.	No.
3	Avila, James	No.
4	Bayuk, Ruth Gonnion	No.
5	Bellugi, Dino Guiduccio (objection states that he has retained Peter Fredman, Esq. to represent him)	Yes. Objector would like to appear with his counsel, but only if they can both do so remotely.
6	Bennett, Gregory A.	No.
7	Boomershine, Philip	No.
8	Brewer, Ron	No.
9	Brown, David D.	No.
10	Burford, Derrick	No.

Exhibit No.	Objector	Request to Appear?
11	Cantore, Deborah E.	No.
12	Charley, Alan	No.
13	Chun, Alex – <u>Untimely Objection</u> ¹	No.
14	Colhson, Richard	No.
15	Cornez, Robert M. by his attorney Heather J. Manolakas, Esq.	No. Neither the Objector nor his attorney requested to appear.
16	Crissman, George	No.
17	Daleo, Diane M.	No.
18	Day, Christopher	No.
19	Debellotte, Vanessa	Only if her attendance is required, which it is not.
20	Dees, Jason L.	No.
21	Dyer, Joyce Jane (deceased) by her husband, James W. Dyer	No.
22	Edwards, Michael	No.
23	Elliott, Nickoy	Objector is uncertain as to whether he will be able to attend.
24	Engling, Timothy	No.
25	Feist, Greg	No.
26	Fischer, Michael	Objector “reserve[s] the right to attend” and plans on attending if his work will allow it.
27	Gardiner, James E.	No.
28	Goodwin, Steven	No.
29	Gregory, Leonard	Yes.
30	Griffin, Tony Barron & Theroux, Claire Jeanne	No.
31	Halverson, Naomi	No.
32	Hawkins, Wendell Gale	No.

¹ Alex Chun’s objection was postmarked February 8, 2024, after the objection deadline (*see* Ex. 13 at p.2), but Class Counsel nonetheless address this Objection in their Brief in support of Final Approval.

Exhibit No.	Objector	Request to Appear?
33	Hayes, Robert M.	No.
34	Hoge, Perry	Objector said he will appear with counsel “if necessary.” He did not disclose his counsel’s name.
35	Hooper, James M.	No.
36	Iyer, Hariharan	No.
37	Jenkins, Deidre	No.
38	Jumper, Daniel	No.
39	Kane, Carlos	No.
40	Kelley, Shannon Easter	No.
41	Lachman, Harlan	No.
42	Laswell, Joseph S.	No.
43	Lichtenberg, Rose Alexandra	No.
44	Lowrance, Rita G.	No.
45	Lynn, Steven	Yes, if Philips covers the cost which it has not agreed to do.
46	Martens, Donna C.	No.
47	McCabe, John J.	No.
48	Mears, Ted	No.
49	Michaud, Denise M.	No.
50	Mierswa, Mark	No.
51	Miller, Tammy Jo	No.
52	Moffatt, Larry	No.
53	Mosteika, Christine, by her husband, Paul Mosteika	No.
54	Naquin, Kenneth	No.
55	O’Neill, Colleen M.	Yes, but only if she can do so remotely.
56	Pitts, Loyd Glen	No.
57	Pitts, Wanda	No.
58	Risser, Susan R.	No.
59	Robinson, Verlin	No.

Exhibit No.	Objector	Request to Appear?
60	Rosenberg, Michael	No.
61	Savage, Yancy	No.
62	Schultz, Adeline	No.
63	Smith, Bill	No.
64	Stewart, Carl W.	No.
65	Susman, John K.	No.
66	Suter, Kassie Gale	No.
67	Sutton, Gwynn (deceased), by his wife, Synneva Sutton	No.
68	Tanasovich, Cheryl	No.
69	Thompson, Ronald (deceased), by his spouse, Donna Thompson	No.
70	Tipton, Anthony R. (objection states that he has retained Ogborn Mihm LLP to represent him)	No. Neither the Objector nor his attorney requested to appear.
71	Toms, Rosalind L.	No.
72	Vandiver, Debra	No.
73	Webb, Jerry	No.
74	White, Donald J. & White, Sharon S.	No.
75	Zeal, Marie	No.
76	Zeman, Gary	No.
77	Zimmermann, Scott	Yes, but only if he can do so remotely.
78	Harrison, Jeffrey B. [also requested to opt out; deadline to make opt- out/objection election is March 21, 2024]	No.

Dated: March 21, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Christopher A. Seeger

Christopher A. Seeger, Esquire
SEEGER WEISS LLP
55 Challenger Rd., 6th Floor
Ridgefield Park, NJ 07660
(973) 639-9100 (phone)
cseeger@seegerweiss.com

/s/ Sandra L. Duggan

Sandra L. Duggan, Esquire
LEVIN SEDRAN & BERMAN LLP
510 Walnut Street, Suite 500
Philadelphia, PA 19106
(215) 592-1500 (phone)
sduggan@lfsblaw.com

/s/ Steven Schwartz

Steven Schwartz, Esquire
CHIMICLES SCHWARTZ KRINER & DONALDSON-
SMITH LLP
361 West Lancaster Avenue
Haverford, PA 19041
(610) 642-8500 (phone)
steveschwartz@chimicles.com

/s/ Kelly K. Iverson

Kelly K. Iverson, Esquire
LYNCH CARPENTER, LLP
1133 Penn Avenue, 5th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
(412) 322-9243 (phone)
kelly@lcllp.com

Roberta D. Liebenberg, Esquire
FINE, KAPLAN AND BLACK, R.P.C.
One South Broad Street, Suite 2300
Philadelphia, PA 19107
(215) 567-6565 (phone)
rliebenberg@finekaplan.com

Lisa Ann Gorshe, Esquire
JOHNSON BECKER PLLC
444 Cedar Street, Suite 1800
Saint Paul, MN 55101
(612) 436-1852 (phone)
lgorshe@johnsonbecker.com

Arthur H. Stroyd, Jr., Esquire
DELSOLE CAVANAUGH STROYD LLC
3 PPG Place, Suite 600
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
412-261-2172 (phone)
astroyd@dscslaw.com

Settlement Class Counsel

/s/ D. Aaron Rihn

D. Aaron Rihn, Esquire
ROBERT PEIRCE & ASSOCIATES, P.C.
707 Grant Street, Suite 125
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 281-7229 (phone)
(412) 281-4229 (fax)
arihn@peircelaw.com

Peter St. Tienne Wolff, Esquire
PIETRAGALLO GORDON ALFANO BOSICK &
RASPANTI, LLP
One Oxford Centre - 38th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 263-2000 (phone)
(412) 263-2001 (fax)
psw@pietragallos.com

Plaintiffs' Co-Liaison Counsel